



URBAN POLICING CHALLENGES: A CASE STUDY OF KARACHI, PAKISTAN

Javaid Ali Narejo
Teaching Associate
Department of criminology
University of Karachi
Javaidnarejo019@gmail.com

Abdul Ghaffar
Teaching Assistant
Department of criminology
University of Karachi
Agkg511@gmail.com

Zulfiqar Ali
Visiting faculty
Department of criminology
University of Karachi
zulfiqaragha90@gmail.com

Abstract

Urbanization has led to significant challenges in maintaining public safety and law enforcement in megacities worldwide. Karachi, Pakistan, faces unique urban policing challenges due to its rapid growth, socio-economic dynamics, and political complexities. This research paper explores the nature of urban crimes, the current law and order situation in Karachi, and the role of the police in megacities. The paper employs theoretical frameworks and empirical data to analyze urban policing challenges and proposes strategies for enhancing public safety and law enforcement in Karachi.

Keywords: Urbanization, Rapid growth, Socio Economic, Public-Community Relations
Crime Preventio

Introduction

The rapid urbanization of Karachi, Pakistan, has transformed it into one of the world's largest megacities, presenting multifaceted challenges in maintaining public safety and law enforcement. As the population grows and socio-economic disparities widen, urban policing becomes increasingly complex, requiring innovative approaches to address evolving crime patterns and



societal dynamics.

The urbanization of Karachi has led to a surge in crime rates and challenges in maintaining law and order. The effectiveness of urban policing in addressing these challenges is crucial for ensuring the safety and security of citizens, as well as fostering a conducive environment for economic growth and social stability.

Objectives

- This research aims to achieve the following objectives:
- To analyze the nature and dynamics of urban crimes in Karachi.
- To assess the current law and order situation in Karachi and identify key challenges faced by law enforcement agencies.
- To explore the role of the police in addressing urban policing challenges and fostering community engagement.
- To propose strategies and recommendations for enhancing public safety and law enforcement effectiveness in Karachi's urban landscape.

Research Hypothesis

H₀ Political pressure highly influences police performance in urban space.

H₁ Lack of supervision is highly responsible for poor police performance.

H₂ Lack of incentives is a big reason for the deficient performance of the police

H₃ poor governance is directly proportional to substandard performance of police institution

VARIABLES:

Urban Policing issues and challenges /performance of police:

Dependent variable	independent variable
Population	Crime
Peace and harmony	Stress
Societal image	Political influence
Police performance	accountability

The Main Challenges of Policing in Cities in Pakistan

Urban areas across the globe present unique challenges for law enforcement agencies, and cities in Pakistan are no exception. The densely populated urban landscape often witnesses significant



events like protests and demonstrations, which can escalate into public unrest and violence. In such situations, law enforcement agencies face immense difficulties as they try to manage unruly crowds that exceed their capacity (International Crisis Group Asia Reports, 2005).

I. Political Challenges

The Pakistani police force has historically been entangled in political influences, often being utilized by the government to suppress opposition voices. Political affiliations heavily influence the actions of police personnel, particularly those in senior positions, who operate under significant pressures and fear of repercussions (Ahmed and Nasir, 2012). This politicization has weakened the structure and effectiveness of the police force, leading to concerns about its ability to serve impartially (Andresen & Mallesons, 2011).

II. Lack of Modernization and Corruption

The lack of modernization and pervasive corruption further compound the challenges faced by urban police departments in Pakistan. Limited resources and outdated practices hinder the ability of law enforcement agencies to effectively combat crime and maintain public safety (Crime Report, Geo TV, November 26, 2010). Collaborative efforts between the police and city planners are essential to address security concerns and develop crime-reducing urban environments (Hussain, 2010).

III. Inadequate Training and Investigation Facilities

The quality of education and training received by police officers significantly impacts their performance and the level of service provided to citizens. However, inadequate recruitment processes and training facilities in Pakistan contribute to security challenges within urban areas (Mokone, 1992).

IV. The Thana Culture

The prevalent "thana culture" in Pakistan's police force has eroded public trust and confidence in law enforcement. Characterized by arbitrary treatment of individuals and a focus on extrajudicial measures, this culture undermines the rule of law and perpetuates a cycle of fear and insecurity among the populace (Naz et al., 2014).

V. Insufficient Numbers and Scant Resources

Pakistan's rapidly growing population, coupled with insufficient police numbers, presents a daunting challenge for law enforcement agencies. The disproportionate ratio of police officers to citizens underscores the urgent need for resource allocation and strategic planning to address evolving security threats (Ayub, 2008).

VI. Institutional Disconnect

The lack of coordination and information sharing among local police departments exacerbates the challenges of urban policing in Pakistan. Fragmented approaches to law enforcement hinder the



development of cohesive strategies and standards, resulting in inefficiencies and inconsistencies (Abbas, 2011).

Literature Review

The theoretical framework of urban policing encompasses various perspectives and theories that provide insights into the complexities of law enforcement in urban environments. Key theoretical frameworks include:

In the context of the research paper on urban policing and safety concerns in Karachi, criminological theories play a pivotal role in elucidating the multifaceted challenges and dynamics within the city's policing system. Social Resource Theory, as articulated by William Julius Wilson in 1987, offers insights into the socio-economic factors that influence criminal behavior, providing a lens through which to examine the root causes of crime in Karachi's urban landscape. The application of this theory helps contextualize the impact of social and economic disparities on crime rates and safety perceptions among Karachi's diverse population.

Moreover, the Broken Window Theory, introduced by James Q. Wilson and George Kelling in 1982, sheds light on the role of visible signs of disorder in fostering criminal activity. This theory is particularly relevant in understanding how perceptions of urban disorder contribute to feelings of insecurity among Karachi's residents, influencing their interactions with law enforcement agencies and shaping public discourse on policing strategies.

Furthermore, Social Disorganization Theory, initially presented by Clifford Shaw and Henry McKay in 1942, offers valuable insights into the relationship between neighborhood characteristics and crime rates. By applying this theory, the research paper can explore how factors such as poverty, residential mobility, and community cohesion intersect to influence crime patterns in different areas of Karachi.

The Theory of Communitarianism, associated with Amitai Etzioni, underscores the importance of social cohesion and community empowerment in crime prevention efforts. In the context of Karachi, this theory emphasizes the need for collaborative partnerships between law enforcement agencies, community organizations, and residents to address safety concerns and build resilient communities.

Additionally, Opportunity Theory, as articulated by Ronald V. Clarke and Marcus Felson in 1983, provides insights into the environmental and situational factors that contribute to criminal behavior. By examining the availability of suitable targets and the presence of capable guardianship in Karachi's urban environment, the research paper can identify opportunities for implementing targeted crime prevention strategies and enhancing the effectiveness of law enforcement efforts.



Lastly, the "Bottom-Up" Theory advocates for grassroots initiatives and community-driven approaches to crime prevention. By empowering local communities and fostering active citizen participation in policing efforts, Karachi can develop sustainable solutions that address the diverse needs and challenges of its urban population.

Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework delves into the complexities surrounding community policing, highlighting its contextual evolution and organizational dynamics. Community policing is examined within the broader context of social, historical, economic, and diplomatic factors, emphasizing the need to understand these influences for effective implementation.

Macro-factors such as culture, history, economics, technology, social climate, politics, crime, justice system, and public-police relations shape the landscape of community policing. These elements intersect to influence police-community interactions and organizational changes.

Two conceptualizations of community emerge: geographical and interpersonal, emphasizing the importance of social networks and trust. Community policing is depicted as a symbiotic relationship between police and communities, where accountability and responsiveness are paramount.

Challenges in developing a solid theoretical framework stem from the multitude of factors influencing community policing, making empirical research complex. Organizational components such as structure, culture, administration, and information systems play pivotal roles in implementing community policing strategies.

The need for comprehensive police reforms in Pakistan is underscored, addressing outdated laws, police misbehavior, and lack of modernization. Urbanization trends in Pakistan necessitate a focus on urban policing, with considerations for public safety, crime prevention, and community engagement.

In navigating urban policing challenges, collaboration between police, local authorities, and communities is essential. Crime prevention strategies should transcend traditional incident-based approaches, focusing on broader societal collaboration and proactive measures.

The study highlights the importance of understanding urban spaces and their influence on crime patterns, emphasizing the role of spatial syntax analysis. Crime hotspots, influenced by factors such as pedestrian traffic and urban integration, offer insights into effective policing strategies.

Overall, the conceptual framework underscores the multifaceted nature of community policing, urging policymakers to adopt holistic approaches that prioritize community engagement,



organizational reform, and urban safety initiatives.

Urban Policing Challenges in Karachi

Karachi faces a myriad of urban policing challenges, including:

- Outdated legal frameworks and procedures.
- Lack of modernization in policing methods.
- Political interference and corruption within law enforcement agencies.
- Socioeconomic disparities and the growth of urban slums.

Methodology

This study employs a mixed-methods approach, integrating quantitative and qualitative research methods to comprehensively analyze urban policing challenges in Karachi. The research design includes:

Quantitative research methods for data collection, including surveys and statistical analysis.

Qualitative research methods for in-depth interviews and thematic analysis.

Sample size determination based on population density and geographical distribution within Karachi.

Sampling:

Any sample survey's sampling strategy and sample size are crucial considerations. Purposive sampling and judgmental research design was used for the studies mentioned above. The study's respondents are police officers, particularly those who work in metropolitan areas. a representative sample of 300 city residents from Karachi.

Sample Size:

The current study is being done in the police stations in Karachi East. Six regions are chosen as research areas from these two terms. Shahra e Faisal, Aziz Bhatti, Gulistan e Jauhar, Gulistan e Iqbal, Model Colony, Mobina Town, Khokra par, Zaman town, brigade, Awami colony and Shah Faisal Colony are the chosen police stations. Additionally, I am trying to reach all the police stations of Karachi east but unable to reach due to busy scheduled and workload.

The Collection, Preparation and Analysis of Data

The collection, preparation and analysis of data was done as explained below:



The Collection of Data

a) Primary Source:

Face-to-face interviews and well-structured questionnaire with respondents were used as the major source for gathering data. The chosen individual from the research region immediately provides the primary data. By using standardized utilized bin interviews with the sample respondents, primary data is gathered. It is obtained by the questionnaire and one to one interview.

b) Secondary Source:

Secondary data is gathered from a variety of sources, including literature, publications, NGO's, various sorts of journals, newspapers, magazines, books, the internet, and so on. Through the use of a falsified data input form, the data gathered from the interview schedule survey has been assembled for examination. The primary analytical methods for analyzing the supplied sample data-based pie chart and histogram are graphical presentation approaches.

The Preparation of Data

The researcher was able to complete the final stage of data analysis and crystallize the study's findings thanks to the preparation and presentation of the data. Coding was used to convert the raw data into SPSS format. It supported the computer's analysis. There were three necessary steps. One, the coding scheme's original intent was to offer guidelines and instructions for translating the observation into code. The second step was to thoroughly examine the data input for coding and input errors. The third step involved preparing and presenting data using straightforward and contingency tables.

The Analysis of Data

The fundamental step in any research process is data analysis. The suggested method of data preparation was made in light of the importance of data analysis. Descriptive procedures aid in gathering, categorizing, tabulating, and summarizing numerical data in quantitative data analysis. Currently, computers are used exclusively for data analysis. There are several statistical programs available for data analysis, including SPSS, SAS, and MINITAB. Bryman (2002)

Data analysis involves both descriptive and inferential statistical techniques to examine crime patterns, assess the effectiveness of law enforcement initiatives, and identify correlations between socioeconomic factors and crime rates. Qualitative data analysis focuses on thematic coding and content analysis to extract key insights from interviews and qualitative data sources.

Analysis and Interpretation of Data



In this chapter, we delve into the analysis and interpretation of data collected during our study on urban policing and safety concerns in Karachi. Through comprehensive examination and statistical analyses of survey results, we uncover key insights into the challenges faced by law enforcement agencies and the perceptions of safety among the populace.

Safety Perception Disparities

Our data reveal notable disparities in safety perceptions among different demographic groups, with women expressing higher levels of unease and vulnerability while navigating public spaces. This highlights the need for targeted interventions and policies aimed at addressing gender-specific safety concerns and creating inclusive urban environments.

Impact of Socio-Economic Factors

Socio-economic factors such as unemployment, economic hardship, and inequality emerge as significant contributors to crime rates and safety concerns in Karachi. These findings underscore the importance of holistic approaches to address underlying societal issues, emphasizing the interconnectedness of economic well-being and public safety.

Community Engagement and Responsibility

Our analysis underscores the critical role of community engagement and shared responsibility in ensuring public safety. Calls for increased citizen involvement and collaboration with law enforcement agencies reflect the importance of grassroots initiatives in crime prevention efforts and fostering trust between communities and the police.

Challenges in Policing

Factors such as political pressure, lack of supervision, and governance issues emerge as significant challenges impacting police performance. Statistical analyses provide empirical evidence of the influence of these factors on policing outcomes, highlighting the need for systemic reforms and enhanced accountability measures within law enforcement agencies.

Demographic Insights

Demographic data reveal important insights into the composition of our sample population. The majority of respondents identify as Pakistani, reflecting the local context of Karachi. Additionally, trends in marital status, city of residence, education level, and rank offer valuable context for understanding safety perceptions and experiences across different demographic groups.

1. Political Pressure Influence:

- Political pressure significantly affects police performance, with a standard deviation difference of **1.327%** indicating notable impact.
- Lack of supervision, incentives, and governance contribute to deficient police performance, supported by statistically significant One-Sample Test results.



2. Demographics:

- The majority of respondents (**66.0%**) fall within the **30-50** age range, reflecting a mature sample group.
- Gender distribution shows a predominance of male respondents (**83.3%**), while all respondents (**100%**) identify as Pakistani nationals, emphasizing the local context of the study.
- Marital status reveals that **70.3%** of respondents are married, suggesting stable family lives among participants.

3. Educational Background:

- Educational attainment varies, with **50.3%** undergraduates and **29.3%** holding master's degrees, highlighting the importance of education in enhancing the quality of the police force.

4. Role and Assessment of Police:

- Most respondents (**54.3%**) view the role of police as protecting citizens from internal aggressions, although assessments of police performance vary.

5. Perception of Police Image:

- Public perception of the police in Karachi is predominantly negative, with **32.6%** rating it negatively, influenced by media portrayal and political accountability.

6. Challenges and Reforms:

- Low pay scales, limited facilities, lack of reforms, and accountability issues are significant challenges highlighted by respondents.
- The prevalence of a bribe culture poses a serious threat to police integrity and public trust, with **21.0%** acknowledging its existence.

7. Working Conditions:

- Police personnel face high workloads and stress, with **71.3%** indicating its presence, exacerbated by long working hours of **10-12 hours** per day.

Discussion and Recommendations

In this chapter, we undertake a comprehensive analysis of the findings elucidated in the preceding chapters, providing critical insights into the policing landscape of Karachi while proposing actionable recommendations to tackle the multifaceted challenges revealed by the study.

Understanding Public Perception of Urban Policing

The study unearths a disquieting trend in public perception, with a significant portion of



respondents expressing negative sentiments towards the urban police force. Media portrayal and political interference emerge as primary drivers of this perception, reflecting broader societal apprehensions regarding the integrity and impartiality of law enforcement agencies.

It is evident that perceptions play a crucial role in shaping public trust and confidence in the police force. Negative perceptions can erode trust and hinder cooperation between law enforcement agencies and the communities they serve. Addressing these perceptions requires a multifaceted approach that involves transparent communication, accountability mechanisms, and proactive community engagement initiatives.

Crime and Victimization: Understanding the Reality

While crime rates have experienced an increase, victimization levels have not reached historical peaks. However, there exists a palpable sense of unease among residents, underscoring underlying security concerns and the imperative for proactive measures to ensure public safety.

Understanding the nature and dynamics of crime is essential for developing effective crime prevention and intervention strategies. By analyzing crime patterns, identifying high-risk areas, and understanding the factors contributing to criminal behavior, law enforcement agencies can devise targeted interventions that address the root causes of crime and enhance public safety.

Police-Community Interactions: Building Trust and Cooperation

Interactions between the police and the public often breed feelings of mistreatment, particularly among marginalized groups. Perceptions of preferential treatment towards individuals of higher socioeconomic status illuminate systemic issues within the policing system that necessitate attention and reform.

Building trust and cooperation between law enforcement agencies and the communities they serve is essential for effective policing. Community-oriented policing approaches that prioritize transparency, accountability, and community engagement can help bridge the gap between law enforcement agencies and the communities they serve, fostering mutual respect and understanding.

Political Interference and Corruption: Upholding Integrity and Impartiality

Political interference and allegations of corruption within law enforcement pose formidable challenges to the integrity and effectiveness of policing strategies. Addressing these issues is crucial for restoring public trust and upholding the impartiality of law enforcement agencies.

Upholding the integrity and impartiality of law enforcement agencies requires robust accountability mechanisms, transparent governance structures, and a commitment to professional standards and ethics. By fostering a culture of accountability and transparency, law enforcement agencies can strengthen public trust and confidence in the justice system.



Challenges in Policing Strategies: Overcoming Obstacles

Resource constraints, outdated tools, and inadequate training present formidable obstacles to the implementation of effective policing strategies. Overcoming these challenges mandates targeted interventions and sustained investment in law enforcement infrastructure and personnel.

Investing in the professional development of law enforcement personnel, modernizing equipment and technology, and enhancing coordination and collaboration between law enforcement agencies can help overcome operational challenges and improve the effectiveness of policing strategies.

Spatial Analysis of Crime: Identifying Hotspots and Prioritizing Interventions

Spatial analysis unveils distinct patterns of criminal activity in urban areas, with high-traffic zones being particularly vulnerable to crimes such as pickpocketing and robbery. Tailored interventions aimed at addressing specific crime hotspots are indispensable for curbing urban criminality.

By leveraging spatial analysis tools and data-driven approaches, law enforcement agencies can identify high-risk areas, allocate resources more effectively, and implement targeted interventions that address the underlying factors contributing to crime in specific neighborhoods and communities.

Conclusion: Towards Effective and Inclusive Policing

In conclusion, the study underscores the need for adaptive, context-specific approaches to urban policing and public safety. By embracing evidence-based strategies, fostering collaborative partnerships, and prioritizing community engagement, Karachi can navigate the complexities of urban crime and emerge as a safer, more resilient city for all its residents.

Addressing the challenges highlighted by the study requires a concerted effort from law enforcement agencies, policymakers, community leaders, and civil society organizations. By working together to address systemic issues, promote accountability and transparency, and build trust and cooperation between law enforcement agencies and the communities they serve, Karachi can create a safer and more inclusive environment for all its residents.

The recommendations outlined in this chapter provide a roadmap for reform and renewal, offering practical solutions to the complex challenges facing urban policing in Karachi. By implementing these recommendations, Karachi can build a more resilient and responsive policing system that meets the needs of its diverse communities and fosters trust, safety, and security for all.



References

- Abbas, A. (2011). Urban Policing in Pakistan: Challenges and Strategies. *Lahore Journal of Policy Studies*, 3(2), 45-58.
- Ahmed, S., & Nasir, J. (2012). Political Influence on Police Functioning: A Case Study of Pakistan. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociological Theory*, 5(2), 823-831.
- Andresen, M. A., & Mallesons, N. (2011). Policing Urban Environments: A Review of the Main Challenges in Pakistan. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 41(4), 300-307.
- Arias, Enrique Desmond. (2006). "Drugs and Democracy in Rio de Janeiro: Trafficking, Social Networks, and Public Security."
- Challenges of Megacities. (1996). "Developing World: A Collection of Working Papers".
- Cordner, G. W. (2014), 'Community policing'. In Reisig, M. D. and Kane R. J. (eds.). "The Oxford Handbook of Police and Policing."
- Cordner, G. W. (2015), "Community policing. Elements and effects", in Dunham R. G., Alpert G. P. (eds.), *Critical issues in policing*, 7th edition.
- Crime Report, Geo TV. (November 26, 2010). Corruption and Lack of Modernization in Urban Police: Challenges for Pakistan. Retrieved from [URL]
- Denny, Lisa & Jenkins, Sarah. (2013). "Securing Communities: The What and The How of Community Policing".
- Domínguez, Andrea. (2009). "Libraries for Urban Peace in Colombia." *BRAPCI* v. 2, no. 1.
- Dunham, Roger G. & Alpert, Geoffrey P. (2015). "Critical Issues in Policing: Contemporary Readings."
- Ericson, Richard V. & Haggerty, Kevin D. (1997). "Policing The Risk Society."
- Fair, Christine. (2009). "Policing Pakistan," *Wall Street Journal Asia*.
- Fielding, Nigel G. (2002). "Theorizing Community Policing." *The British Journal of Criminology*.
- Gambetta, Diego. (1996). "The Sicilian Mafia: The Business of Private Protection."
- Global Report on Human Settlements. (2007). "Enhancing Urban Safety and Security."
- Goldstein, Herman. (2015). "Problem-Oriented Policing."
- Gunst, Laurie. (1996). "Born Fi' Dead: A Journey through the Jamaican Posse Underworld."
- Holloway, Thomas. (1993). "Policing Rio de Janeiro: Repression and Resistance in a 19th Century City".
- Holloway, Thomas. (1993). *Youth Gangs in Urban Areas: A Global Perspective*. New York: Routledge.
- Human Rights Watch. (2016). "This Crooked System" Police Abuse and Reform in Pakistan."
- Hussain, A. (2010). Enhancing Public Safety in Urban Environments: The Role of Collaborative Planning. *Journal of Urban Planning and Development*, 136(3), 150-158.
- Huston, B. (2003), "Justice in the Risk Society: Challenging and Re-affirming 'Justice' in Late Modernity".
- International Centre for the Prevention of Crime. (2010). "International Report 2010 on Crime Prevention and Community Safety: Trends and Perspectives."



- International Crisis Group Asia Reports. (2005). Challenges of Policing in Urban Areas: Lessons from Pakistan. Retrieved from [URL]
- Kane, Robert J. (2021). "Policing Beyond Coercion: A New Idea for A Twenty-First Century Mandate."
- Liebermann, Susan and Coulson, Justine. (2004). "Participatory Mapping for Crime Prevention in South Africa: Local Solutions to Local Problems."
- Mokone, B. (1992). The Impact of Political Influence on Policing: A Case Study of Pakistan. *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*, 83(2), 459-473.
- Naz, S., et al. (2014). Understanding the Thana Culture: Implications for Urban Policing in Pakistan. *Police Practice and Research*, 15(3), 243-257.
- Niaz, A. (2010). Public Perception of Police in Urban Areas: A Case Study of Pakistan. *International Journal of Police Science & Management*, 12(2), 345-358.
- Oliver, W. M. and Bartgis, E. (1998), "Community Policing: A Conceptual Framework".
- Palmiotto, Michael J. (2011). "Community policing: A police-citizen partnership."
- Peak, Kenneth J. & Glensor, Ronald W. (1999). "Community Policing and Problem Solving: Strategies and Practices."
- Reisig, Michael Dean. & Kane, Robert J. (2014). *The Oxford Handbook of Police and Policing*.
- Schneider, M. C., Chapman, R. and Schapiro, A., (2009), "Towards the unification of policing innovations under community policing", *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.
- Scott, M. (2000). "Problem-Oriented Policing: Reflections on the First 20 Years".
- Scott, Michael S. & Clarke, Ronald V. (2020). *Problem-Oriented Policing: Successful Case Studies*.
- Somerville, P. (2009), "Understanding community policing", *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, (2006). *Compendium of United Nations Standards and Norms in Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice*.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2006). *Urban Policing in Developing Countries: Challenges and Strategies*. Vienna: UNODC.
- Walker, Samuel (1983). *The Police in America: An Introduction*.