



THE PRACTICE OF GENUINE MULTILATERALISM: THE INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF THE SHANGHAI COOPERATION ORGANIZATION

Ding Weihang

Lecturer

Sinicization of Marxism and New Era Shanghai Development Research Center

School of Marxism

University of Shanghai for Science and Technology (USST)

Shanghai – China

dwh1010@usst.edu.cn

This paper is a study result of the key social science project “National Security Education in Universities”, supported by USST. (Project Number: 1F-21-342-102)

Abstract

The Shanghai Cooperation Organization(SCO) is a typical case of genuine multilateralism practised by China, Russia, the five Central Asian states, India and Pakistan. To study the institutionalization and membership expansion process of the SCO, this paper preliminarily selects four variables, namely crisis management, common interests, international coordination and collective intention, and explores how the actors, which are full of competition and conflict at different levels, reach consensus and finally form a new organizational form. This paper assumes that in the international community, countries build collective intentions through international interaction or coordination based on common interests and the needs of crisis management. After reaching the collective intention, it continues to construct the international system through international interaction. We believe that international interaction runs through the process of institutionalization or system construction, and the institutionalization of multilateral consensus is the process of constructing a multilateral system by the common ideas of all countries. Therefore, with the enlargement and deep institutionalization of the SCO, genuine multilateralism will be more fully practised and developed.

Keywords: Genuine Multilateralism, Shanghai Cooperation Organization(SCO), Institutionalization, Member Expansion

Introduction

Genuine multilateralism is in contrast to "pseudo-multilateralism", which at different times in world history has often been disguised or couched as different forms of "selective multilateralism" by



countries seeking to pursue their national interests or the common interests of their Allies. Every nation, regardless of its size, strength, wealth, or poverty, is regarded as an integral part of the global community. They have the right to participate in the global multilateral system, express their opinions, and collaborate with each other on issues of international importance. The ultimate aim is to foster cooperation, safeguard the shared interests of all nations, and ensure fair distribution of developmental benefits. Therefore, to fundamentally crack or properly deal with the strategic means of contact, containment, isolation, encirclement and blockade adopted by the United States and its Allies in different periods, different fields and different degrees to stop China's development, break away from its inherent Cold War mentality and zero-sum game logic, and recognize the nature of its attempts to maintain hegemony through "bloc politics". We must thoroughly lift the veil of "pseudo-multilateralism" and uphold and practice genuine multilateralism. Taking the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) as an example, this paper argues that SCO is a typical case of genuine multilateralism practised by China, Russia, the five Central Asian states and even India and Pakistan. The institutionalization of the SCO mainly consists of three steps: the first step is the original institutional framework established by the founding members to settle disputes between states; the second step is the deep institutionalization arising from the increasing objectification of common beliefs; and the third step is the re-institutionalization or de-institutionalization occurring with the increase or decrease of common interests and the increase or decrease of the number of member states.

Initially named as the "Central Asian Regional Cooperation Organization," the Shanghai Cooperation Organization emphasized the importance of adhering to its regional orientation, centered around the "Central Asian region," while also allowing neighboring countries to participate as observer states and extra-regional dialogue partners. It emphasized that the SCO's functional orientation was not to establish a military alliance, even though the organization originated from military and security consultations. Its purpose is to promote development and benefit its member states. The reason why this study chooses "Shanghai Cooperation Organization" as the case is that it is positioned as "Central Asian Regional Cooperation Organization" and covers the entire eastern, central and northern part of Eurasia, occupying two-thirds of the total area of Eurasia and one-fourth of the world's population. Secondly, it started from military security consultations, with security issues as the primary concern, and gradually moved to economic, political and cultural cooperation. Finally, its main members are Russia and China, the two permanent members of the United Nations Security Council. Its strategic, regional and functional orientation is one of the indispensable cases of real multilateralism research.

□ **Crisis Management: International counter-terrorism cooperation initiated the institutionalization of consensus**

At the crisis management level, the institutionalization process of the SCO consensus has been affected by three aspects. First, the settlement of the Sino-Soviet "boundary question" and military mutual trust in border areas prompted the birth of the "Shanghai Five" cooperation mechanism. This



mechanism fosters a consensus basis for long-term cooperation among countries. For example, on July 5, 2000, the Foreign Ministers of China, Tajikistan, Russia and Kyrgyzstan pointed out that the cooperation within the framework of the "Shanghai Five" is non-aligned, non-exclusive and not directed against any third country, and is making important contributions to regional security and stability (Peoples Daily, July 5, 2000). Second, the global and Eurasian geopolitical turmoil after the Cold War continued to strengthen and continue the "Shanghai Five" consensus on cooperation, and to a certain extent expanded the consensus basis of the five countries. Third, the three forces in Central Asia, especially the terrorist forces, have seriously threatened the security of the five countries. Therefore, the cooperation consensus of the five countries in the field of counter-terrorism has directly promoted the institutionalization of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization. Fourth, issues such as international conflicts, terrorist activities and economic development within South Asia all require joint governance with neighbouring countries or regions, which led to the first expansion of the SCO membership.

□ **The China-Soviet Union "boundary issue" led to the birth of the "Shanghai Five" mechanism**

China, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan created the "Shanghai Five" to reduce border anxieties from China's experience with the Soviet Union and boost trust and disarmament. Qian Qichen and Shevardnadze began discussions on this topic in April 1990. In Moscow, they signed the Agreement on Guiding Principles for the Reciprocal Reduction of Military Forces in Border Areas and the Building of Military Trust. This agreement reduced military troops along the border between the two nations. With the demise of the Soviet Union, Chinese and Soviet negotiators switched to a "five states and two parties" structure, with China on one side and Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan on the other. Wang Haiyang (2015) states that border military mutual trust and disarmament agreements help normalise ties between nations. By eliminating the Cold War rivalry between China and the Soviet Union, this will allow good-neighborly friendliness to flourish.

Under the international environment and historical background at that time, the upheavals in Eastern Europe and the disintegration of the Soviet Union were unexpected and failed to form a mature and stable new pattern to replace the old system of international relations. The confrontation between the two polar patterns does not mean that the differences in the geopolitical economy have been closed. On the contrary, the relations between countries and regions have become more complex, from the original single to multiple, from the original relatively stable to complex and changeable. On the one hand, the Cold War mentality still exists, and old grievances between the two powers that used to be on opposite sides cannot be resolved. On the other hand, it is still difficult for many regions to change the security structure and international rules formed during the Cold War. Ethnic and religious issues in the former Soviet Union were "out of control", and various extremist and separatist forces emerged, threatening regional security at any time. It was in such an international environment that China, Russia and the Central Asian countries needed a favourable



regional environment to develop themselves and promote economic and social development as soon as possible. Therefore, the establishment of the "Shanghai Five" mechanism complied with the international and regional situation that was fraught with crises at that time.

□ **The new geopolitical situation continues the institutional cooperation of the "Shanghai Five"**

The establishment of the SCO has a profound strategic background. It is the result of the adjustment of the regional pattern triggered by the double oscillations of the global and Eurasian geopolitical environment after the Cold War, the need to address the important challenges faced by all countries in the region in the period of the transition of international relations, and the natural continuation and development of equal cooperation between the Shanghai Five countries with a new security concept. (Xu Tao, Ji Zhiye, 2002) After the Cold War, a "new geopolitical turbulence belt" appeared in Eurasia: the first one was along the Baltic States through Central Europe to the Balkans; the second was along Pakistan, through Central Asia, to the Near East and the Arabian Peninsula, and finally to Algeria, Sudan and other countries; the third was located in the border region of India, Sri Lanka and Pakistan in the South Asian subcontinent. (Lu Zhongwei, 2000) These three crisis zones are at the edge of the world division of labour system and have not made progress in the process of regionalization. At the beginning of the 21st century, the competition for geopolitical and economic resources around the Eurasian continent became more intense. First, while promoting the eastward expansion of NATO and strengthening the US-Japan military alliance, the United States intends to carry out the new Central Asia strategy by conducting multi-directional penetration in the Central Asia region. (Feng Yujun, 1997) Second, the future of Central Asia is related to Russia's national interests. Any fluctuation in this region will directly affect Russia's security environment. Therefore, holding this "position" is the final bottom line of Russia's relations with NATO. Third, with its geographical and cultural advantages, Turkey actively expanded its power to Central Asia, trying to become a regional power and revive the Ottoman empire. Fourth, Iran tries to meddle in the affairs of Central Asia by taking advantage of religion and geography. Fifth, oil companies from Japan and Western European countries have also entered Central Asia to obtain a stable energy supply from the region. Therefore, after the Cold War, the competition between global powers and regional forces in Central Asia makes the international situation in this region complicated and the strategic pressure increased, which makes them have to seek and deepen institutional cooperation.

□ **Counter-terrorism cooperation promotes the institutionalization and expansion of the SCO**

Once the Soviet Union collapsed, Central Asia was hit severely by national separatist movements, religious extremism, and international terrorism due to the region's myriad internal challenges unleashing pent-up energy. The War in Afghanistan, the Chechen War, West Asian fanaticism, drug and weapon smuggling, and other issues threaten China, Russia, and Central Asia's security. According to a 2002 study by Xu Tao and Ji Zhiye, Central Asian and neighbouring countries need a more institutionalised and effective security mechanism based on the cooperation consensus to



jointly respond to the regional security situation, effectively combat ethnic separatism, religious extremism, and terrorism, and maintain security and stability. It is worth noting that ethnic separatist forces in Central Asia are seeking ethnic secession and independence in a multi-ethnic sovereign state under the banner of "national self-determination", which seriously undermines and threatens the sovereignty of Central Asian states and endangers regional international security, stability and economic development. The "transnational nationalism" with pan-Turkism and pan-Islamism as its main contents has seriously affected the political stability, economic development and social progress of the northwestern provinces of China. Therefore, China has been paying close attention to the activities and influence of Islamic extremist forces in Central Asia, staying on high alert and taking effective measures to prevent them. Generally speaking, in the face of the grim regional security situation, China and Russia, while considering their common interests, actively respond to and coordinate the security cooperation needs of Central Asian countries. The Shanghai Cooperation Organization and CIS Anti-Terrorism Center have grown due to all nations' efforts.

Afghanistan, Central Asia, China's Xinjiang, and Chechnya in the Caucasus have all been worldwide terrorist hotspots in the new century. Terrorists are increasingly targeting Central Asia. To protect China, Russia, and the five Central Asian nations, peace and stability in the area and the elimination of terrorist groups are necessary.

First, terrorism in Central Asia threatens local and global civilization. The SCO helps keep Central Asia peaceful. The SCO also guarantees global crisis resolution. At present, there are dozens of international terrorist organizations in this region. Among them, the most influential and harmful ones are the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, which is notorious for assassinating the president of Uzbekistan, mobilizing nearly 1,000 militants to attack neighbouring countries and intervening in the "Andijan" riots; "Hizb ut-Tahrir", which is known for its relatively covert activities and its largest public support, and its terrorist attacks in China's Xinjiang and Russia and Tajikistan, and for its participation in al Qaeda in fighting against the US military. East Turkistan-based terrorist organisations threaten Central Asian territorial and socioeconomic stability. These threats mask the underlying magnitude of these organisations' danger to Central Asia's safety and stability.

Second, Central Asian terrorist groups threaten China and Russia's national security, and the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) promotes peace along their shared borders. The most evident warning indicators are: Russia's anti-terrorism campaign targets Chechnya-linked terrorists and the veiled threat of fragmentation. China's anti-terrorism measures in Central Asia aim to defeat "East Turkistan" terrorists and stabilise the northwest border region's economy and society. China's Central Asian anti-terrorism measures contrast with Russia's, which target Chechen terrorists. "East Turkistan" terrorist groups have operated in Central Asia for years. These groups stage their Xinjiang attacks here. Nonetheless, China has benefitted from Central Asian counter-terrorism cooperation, notably the Shanghai Cooperation Organization declaration's counter-terrorism consensus and the adoption of various counter-terrorism accords that provide a legal framework for fighting terrorist organisations. Additional benefits of this partnership for China include: Central



Asian countries have begun to take the initiative to fight against terrorist organizations related to East Turkistan, which has changed the passive situation of China in counter-terrorism in the past, and so on. As for Russia's counter-terrorism interests in Central Asia, on the one hand, terrorist organizations linked to Chechnya have been carrying out violent terrorist activities for a long time, causing serious damage to Russian society, politics and economy. On the other hand, the joint efforts of Central Asian countries to crack down on and eradicate terrorist organizations related to Chechnya can effectively prevent the recurrence of the historical tragedy of the collapse of the Soviet Union. Although the anti-terrorism of China and Russia in Central Asia is based on their interests, the fundamental interest of the two countries is to eradicate the terrorist forces in Central Asia, which is conducive to China and Russia in supporting Central Asian countries to fight against regional terrorist forces to reach consensus and concerted actions.

Thirdly, terrorism in Central Asia provides an excuse for the United States to intervene in Central Asia, and the establishment of the SCO is conducive to combating the interference of the United States in Central Asia. As early as 1997, the United States had begun to compete for dominance in Central Asia, and it realized the differentiation of the Central Asian economic Union by attracting Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan. (Xu Yaqing, 2003) After September 11, the United States maintained its military presence in Central Asia, further expanded its political influence, promoted regional geopolitical diversification, prevented Central Asian countries from getting closer to Russia, and continuously provided assistance and loans. In the name of anti-terrorism, the United States intervenes in Central Asia, which not only can contain the Islamic forces in the south of Central Asia but also affects the interests of Russia and China. The establishment of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization first made China, Russia and four Central Asian countries coexist peacefully and strengthen coordination and consultation in regional affairs. Second, the establishment of the SCO has not only safeguarded the interests of its member states but also enhanced their initiative in regional cooperation. Finally, the establishment of the SCO is a better response to America's double standards in the fight against terrorism and its infiltration into Central Asia.

Fourth, the extremist terrorist forces in South Asia are complex and frequently engaged in terrorist activities, which are closely connected with the extremist forces in Central Asia, the Middle East and other regions. Therefore, the security environment and energy supply required by the economic development of South Asia cannot be separated from the cooperation with China, Russia and Central Asian countries. Only through long-term and stable cooperation with neighbouring regions and countries, Only in this way can we fundamentally guarantee continuous counter-terrorism in South Asia and provide reliable security guarantees and energy supply for the economic development of South Asia. It is a long-term strategic choice for India and Pakistan to join the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) and join hands with China, Russia and Central Asian countries to combat terrorist forces and promote economic development. It is worth mentioning that the chaos in Afghanistan has been threatening neighbouring Central Asia, and the collusion of Islamic extremist forces in Central Asia and South Asia has formed a close connection, threatening



the security of the two regions. Therefore, the security and economic development of SCO member states cannot be achieved without coordination and cooperation with South Asian countries.

□ **Common Interests: Energy and security interests lay the foundation for institutionalization**

□ **Common strategic energy interests**

Based on maintaining the security and stability of Central Asia, the geo-economic significance of Central Asia is becoming more and more obvious. Central Asia has rich strategic resources, and its reserves of non-ferrous metals and rare metals occupy an important position in the world. More importantly, Central Asia is rich in oil and gas resources and will become an important guarantee for the sustainable development of the world economy in the future. (An Zuoxiang, Hu Zhengqin,1993) At present, some countries in Central Asia have made the production and export of oil and gas the focus of their economic development strategies, and have decided to follow the path of other countries such as Saudi Arabia and Kuwait. For China, which is facing the dilemma of rapid economic development and increasing energy demand, the energy advantage of Central Asia is of great significance.

The energy interests of China and Russia in Central Asia mainly exist in the following three situations. First, China's main energy interest in Central Asia is the construction of multiple Central Asia-China oil and gas pipelines. On the one hand, it can eliminate the security risks caused by China's heavy reliance on maritime transport routes. On the other hand, these oil and gas channels are only oil and gas pipelines between China and Central Asian countries, which have no direct relationship with Russia and may even affect Russia's energy interests. Second, Russia's main economic interest in Central Asia is to ensure that Central Asian countries continue to export part of their oil and gas through Russian pipelines. (Sun Jing,2014) On the one hand, several Central Asia-Russia-Europe oil and gas pipelines are conducive to ensuring that the oil and gas of Central Asian countries can be exported to Europe through Russia, which is conducive to Russia's control of the energy interests of Central Asian countries. On the other hand, these pipelines only benefit Russia and Central Asian countries and have nothing to do with China. As far as the first two points are concerned, either it only serves the common interests of China and Central Asia, but cannot satisfy or even damage Russia's interests, or it only serves the common interests of Russia and Central Asia, but has nothing to do with China's interests. Based on this, the only way is to find a path that meets the common interests of China, Russia and Central Asian countries at the same time. If it can benefit the energy interests of more countries, it is the better choice. Third, the construction of several Russia-Central Asia-China-Japan-ROK energy pipelines is a common interest of China and Russia in Central Asia. On the one hand, Russia has huge oil and gas reserves, which can make several Russia-Central Asia-China-Japan-South Korea oil and gas pipelines run at full capacity. On the other hand, the Central Asia-China oil and gas pipeline is close to the Russian energy pipeline, which can save investment costs and connect to Japan and South Korea in the east, while China, South Korea and South Korea just have such energy demand.



Energy considerations for India and Pakistan to join the SCO. For India, joining the SCO reflects its need for energy. India's growing population and rapid economic growth are increasing its energy demand. (Snapshot of India's Petroleum&Gas Data, June 22, 2015) India's heavy dependence on oil and gas has become an important factor restricting India's economic development and threatening India's national security. To this end, the Indian government has made securing overseas energy assets a national strategy and is actively seeking cooperation with oil and gas-rich countries. The SCO member states are rich in oil and natural gas resources. As mentioned above, energy cooperation is the focus of cooperation among China, Russia and the five Central Asian states. Therefore, strengthening bilateral and multilateral energy cooperation with the SCO member states under the framework of the SCO can effectively alleviate the problem of energy scarcity in India and Pakistan. Energy resources to meet the economic development needs of India and Pakistan. Likewise, the energy problem is a major problem restricting Pakistan's economic development. Pakistan's energy Minister Khawaja Asif has said, "The energy crisis is a greater threat to Pakistan's national security and economy than terrorism. Energy shortages have crippled Pakistan's economy for more than a decade. In addition to oil and natural gas resources, Pakistan is also relatively short of power resources. Therefore, Pakistan's joining the Shanghai Cooperation Organization will help solve its energy crisis through multilateral cooperation.

□ **Common military and security interests**

As mentioned above, the United States launched its first Central Asia Strategy in July 1997 and began to gradually intervene in the economic, political, military and security fields of Central Asia. On the economic front, the United States has encouraged Central Asian countries to form a Central Asian Economic Community without Russia's participation, offered economic assistance with political conditions to achieve cooperation with Central Asia, and tried to break Russia's control over the region's energy exports. In politics, the United States spreads its political values through economic aid channels. In terms of military security, the United States began to enter Central Asia on the pretext of eliminating nuclear weapons in Kazakhstan, directly sending troops to participate in the "Central Asia Battalion" military exercises, and participating in the military field in Central Asia by providing military equipment and officer training. (Sun Jing,2014) After the "September 11" incident, the US military deployment in Central Asia directly led to the decline of the strategic security of neighbouring countries, especially China and Russia. The US military penetration in Central Asia directly threatened the security interests of the two countries. With the Afghan War as an opportunity, the United States fully realized its military presence in Central Asia and increased its military assistance to Central Asian countries. For China, the US garrison in Central Asia poses a great threat to China's national sovereignty and territorial integrity, and China's western frontier is directly confronted with the US military threat. For Russia, the stationing of US troops in Central Asia will make the southern security barrier of Russia no longer exist, leaving Russia's "soft belly" vulnerable to attacks by the US military, and even threatening the important passageway connecting Russia with the East and West. Therefore, the stationing of American troops in Central Asia makes



China and Russia encounter very similar military security environments: China is faced with the military security threat of being flanked by the east and the west, while Russia is faced with the military security pressure from the east, west and south. In addition, China and Russia are the biggest neighbours in Central Asia, so the countries in Central Asia have to consider the military security impact on China and Russia caused by their factors. Central Asian countries need China and Russia to maintain security in Central Asia. Western aid is not enough for Central Asian countries to achieve sustainable development. They also need guarantees from China and Russia. Therefore, from the perspective of China, Russia and Central Asian countries, it is necessary to unite and cooperate to realize common military and security interests.

Security interests of India and Pakistan in joining the SCO. For India, one of the main strategic goals of its joining the SCO is to build a strategic partnership network in Eurasia, to obtain the great power status it pursues. Joining the SCO will not only help it become a major power in Eurasia or the Indo-Pacific but also enhance its influence in the region to reach out to its interests in Central Asia, counter-terrorism, promote connectivity and safeguard energy security. Similarly, terrorist forces in Pakistan collude with those outside the country, posing a threat to the national security of Pakistan and its surrounding regions. Pakistan's accession to the SCO will enable Pakistan and the SCO to assume greater security responsibilities and play a more effective role in the field of security, to jointly safeguard the regional security situation. As Khalid Mohamud, Chairman of the World Affairs Council in Islamabad, Pakistan, stressed, "The SCO plays an important role in regional security, infrastructure, energy and economic and trade cooperation. The commitment of the SCO member states to establish a common framework and carry out joint actions to safeguard common interests will help them cope with new challenges and threats and create favourable conditions for sustainable social and economic development. (XinhuaNet, July 7, 2015) Therefore, the accession of India and Pakistan to the SCO serves the common security interests of all parties.

Economic cooperation is the basis for the consolidation and development of the SCO, and sound economic ties are the prerequisite for institutionalizing bilateral relations and multilateral consensus among member states. The accession of India and Pakistan, on the one hand, has expanded the SCO's geo-economic space, on the other hand, increased the SCO's economic cooperation potential, and promoted the diversification of cooperation areas and modes. (Ding Chao,2017) For a long time, Pakistan's economic development has been restricted by domestic terrorist attacks, the serious shortage of energy and imperfect infrastructure construction. Therefore, joining the SCO is not only for deepening security cooperation, but in the long run, economic development and social stability are the most important common interests of Pakistan and other SCO member states. Similarly, in addition to maintaining bilateral cooperation with China and Russia, India also began to intervene in Central Asian affairs with the enhancement of its economic and military strength. In June 2012, The first India-Central Asia Track Dialogue was held in Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan. The then-Indian Foreign Minister put forward the policy of "Connecting Central Asia". These four aspects include Commerce, Connectivity, diplomatic affairs and Community to promote relations between India and Central Asian countries. There is no doubt that India's entry into the SCO will



enable it to deeply participate in regional economic and trade affairs.

□ **International Coordination: From bilateral to a multilateral forum**

□ **From the "bilateral" Shanghai Summit to the "multilateral" Dushanbe Summit**

After the long confrontation between China and Soviet Union was completely over, it was an urgent task to solve the problem of mutual trust in the border area. China and the USSR agreed to reduce border troops in April 1990. This was done to build confidence and reduce military tensions. Once the Soviet Union collapsed, China and Russia decided to maintain their bilateral relations, while China and Central Asia soon established diplomatic relations. (Xing Wencheng, Sun Zhuangzhi, 2007) Since March 1992, one side represented by China and the other side represented by Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan has continued negotiations on border disarmament, namely "Bilateral negotiations of the Shanghai Five".(Pan Guang, Hu Jian,2006) The main topics of the talks are military levels and troop composition after border disarmament. Since the Chinese proposal was not initially endorsed by the Joint Mission, to avoid a deadlock, the Joint Mission proposed to address the question of confidence-building measures in the military field in the border areas in a separate document,(Tovyeka, K., 2002) and the disarmament agreement was signed separately. Following 22 rounds of discussions, the two parties agreed on the terms of a treaty to reduce military forces on both sides of the border in December 1995. In April 1996, the five chiefs of state signed the Agreement on Improving Military Trust in Border Areas at the Shanghai Exhibition Center. This agreement formalised the results of periodic talks into a legal instrument. In April 2012, the five leaders met in Moscow to finalise the Agreement on Reciprocal Reduction of Military Forces in Border Regions. When the two nations signed the agreement, border region trust and disarmament negotiations ended. After the agreement, high-level discussions to consult and negotiate on linked subjects continued.

Once the summit relocated to Central Asia, the region's difficult security situation became the main topic. Participants wanted to coordinate action against the "three terrible forces"—terrorism, separatism, and extremism—that threaten the region's security. In July 1998, the five leaders met again in Almaty, Kazakhstan, after the Moscow summit. This gathering intended to discuss implementing the two-state accord. At the same time, leaders of the participating countries reached a consensus on establishing a regular security and cooperation mechanism. The fourth meeting was held in Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan, in August 1999, when the border disarmament agreement entered into force and the five countries began to inform each other of the situation of their border forces. Against the backdrop of the deteriorating regional security situation and frequent terrorist activities, the meeting paid strong attention to regional security issues. As the P5 Meeting has gradually become institutionalized, meetings at different levels have been held within the P5 framework. The Joint Communique was signed by the ministers of defence from all five nations during a conference that took place in Astana, which is the capital city of Kazakhstan, in March of 2000. On July 4, 2000, in Dushanbe, the capital of Tajikistan, the foreign ministers of the



five nations and the observer representative from Uzbekistan convened to address a wide range of issues. The foreign minister of Tajikistan was there as well and participated in the meeting. They came to the conclusion that encouraging economic cooperation among the five countries not only satisfies the objective needs of economic globalisation but also creates an environment that is amenable to the maintenance of security and stability in Central Asia and its neighbouring regions as well as the achievement of national revitalization and economic development. They came to this conclusion after reaching a consensus that encouraging economic cooperation among the five countries not only satisfies the objective needs of economic globalization but also creates an environment that is amenable to the maintenance of Once all was said and done, all five of the separate ministers of foreign affairs signed a joint communiqué. The five chiefs of state gathered the next day in Dushanbe for their fifth meeting, during which they signed the Dushanbe Declaration. This occurrence took happened the day after that. The leaders came to the conclusion that "the establishment and development of the Shanghai Five mechanism embodies a new type of state-to-state relations based on equality, cooperation, mutual trust and mutual benefit, which is non-aligned, open, and not directed against any third country," which has improved the state of contemporary diplomacy and regional cooperation, as well as contributed to the maintenance of safety and security in the region. In addition, the leaders came to the conclusion that "the establishment and development of the Shanghai Five mechanism embodied. In conclusion, both the horizontal and vertical components of consensus have been institutionalized, and the scope of cooperation has broadened with each succeeding conference (as reported by Xing Wencheng and Sun Zhuangzhi in 2007).

The smooth development of the "Shanghai Five" meeting mechanism, especially the positive attitude of the member states towards multilateral cooperation at the Dushanbe Summit, before the start of a new round of heads of state summit, it is necessary to consider the establishment of a closer way and means of cooperation and provide corresponding institutional guarantees. After the discussion, a consensus was soon reached on the establishment of a new type of regional cooperation organization. In June 2001, the summit of the five countries returned to Shanghai, and the Shanghai Cooperation Organization was established.

□ **Interaction between Pakistan, India and the Shanghai Cooperation Organization**

Long before the establishment of the SCO, Pakistan had the intention and action to join the SCO. It submitted two formal applications to the rotating presidency of the SCO that year, requesting to join the "Shanghai Five". The summit examined how Pakistan, Iran, and India's observer status at the Heads of State Council meeting in Astana on July 5, 2005, boosted the SCO's potential for multilateral and mutually beneficial cooperation in many domains. India now respects the Shanghai Cooperation Organization. In the early days of the SCO, India showed relatively cold interest in the organization and kept a certain distance, but at the same time, it kept a close eye on the development trend of the SCO. (Qiu Changqing,2019) After becoming an observer state in 2005, India has sought Shanghai Cooperation Organization membership (SCO). With the SCO's



expanding importance, India has tried to enhance India-SCO cooperation in political, security, economic, and other areas. Manmohan Singh attended the 2009 and 2011 Shanghai Cooperation Organization meetings in Russia and Kazakhstan, respectively. When the 2010 summit in Tashkent relaxed the SCO's embargo on new members, an Indian Ministry of Foreign Affairs spokesman said India meets all SCO membership standards. The 2010 Tashkent summit abolished the bar on new members. (Shubhajit Roy, 2010) India proposed joining the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) during a 2014 heads of state conference in Tajikistan's capital, Dushanbe. On July 9 and 10, 2015, at Ufa, SCO chiefs of state approved the admissions procedure for India and Pakistan, to the joy of SCO members. Ufa hosted the July 9–10 summit. On June 9, 2017, the SCO's Heads of State Council in Astana accepted the decision of the SCO Member States' Heads of State Council recognising India and Pakistan as members after both nations completed their 2016 commitments. The SCO Heads of State Council delivered the resolution. The Member States believe extending the SCO's membership and working with observer nations and dialogue partners will provide beneficial results.

□ **Collective Intention: Shanghai Cooperation Declaration and Convention on Combating the Three Forces**

The collective intention is not only the result of international coordination but also the reflection of the common interests or interest relations of all parties. First of all, Although The Agreement on Strengthening Confidence in the Military Field in the Border Areas reached at the "Bilateral Summit of the Shanghai Five" in Shanghai was the product of years of negotiations, a bilateral document with many countries, but the first meeting of the leaders of the five countries became the beginning of an important multilateral mechanism. The agreement aims to develop military mutual trust, peace, and stability, as well as long-term good-neighborly and friendly relations between China, Russia, and Central Asian border states. Gathering border countries will achieve these aims. It also shows Asia-Pacific nations how to build trust and neighbourliness. Next year, the five nations signed the Agreement on Mutual Reduction of Military Forces in Border Areas in Moscow. It can be seen that the reaching of consensus (signing agreements jointly) and international coordination have positive interactions. The purpose or result of international coordination is to reach a consensus, and the formation of a consensus is conducive to international coordination with more mutual trust.

Second, at the Almaty Summit in 1998, the heads of state of the five countries reached a consensus on establishing a regular security and cooperation mechanism. After the meeting, the foreign ministers of the five countries signed a joint statement, stressing that "mutual respect for sovereignty and territorial integrity, equality and mutual benefit, non-interference and other universally recognized norms governing international relations; Resolve differences and disputes between countries through friendly consultations; Jointly combat all forms of ethnic separatism and religious extremism, terrorist activities, arms smuggling, smuggling and drug trafficking and other public hazards in the region; To further strengthen economic relations among the five countries



based on mutual benefit and effectiveness; Make joint Efforts with the international community to stop the nuclear Arms Race in South Asia and maintain the international Nuclear non-proliferation regime ".(Luo Yuan,2002) This means that the Shanghai Five countries have reached a consensus on issues such as sovereignty, territory, dispute settlement and combating the "three forces". This is not only a continuation of the consensus reached at the previous two meetings but also a foundation for the subsequent establishment of the SCO. At the same time, the meeting also marks a shift from the previous "Bilateral meeting of the Shanghai Five" to a multilateral meeting.

Third, in 1999, the heads of state of the five countries issued a joint statement after their fourth meeting in Bishkek, stating that they firmly oppose ethnic separatism and religious extremism and jointly combat international terrorism, trafficking, drug trafficking and other transnational crimes. It emphasises the importance of economic and trade cooperation based on equality and mutual benefit, encourages bilateral cooperation between the five countries, and actively seeks multilateral cooperation; the five leaders reaffirm their firm determination not to allow the use of their territory for acts that undermine the sovereignty, security, and social order of any of the Five States. (2002) The concept that human rights should not be used to justify intervention in domestic affairs and the necessity for a multi-polar world to maintain international security have been underlined.

Fourth, the Joint Communiqué was signed in Astana, Kazakhstan's capital, by the five defence ministers in March 2000. In the nation's capital. The five nations have agreed to study increased military confidence-building measures, border defence agency collaboration, and transnational crimes including drug and weapon smuggling. The three forces of ethnic division, religious extremism and terrorist activities will not be tolerated. Resolutely oppose any activities against other countries by these forces on its territory and jointly take effective measures to combat them; Jointly hold joint military exercises to prevent the occurrence of various possible crises. (World Military Yearbook of the AMS,2001) All in all, the joint communiqué reached by the five defence ministers reflects the five countries' cooperation intentions in traditional military and political fields, opposing and combating the three evil forces, nuclear non-proliferation and anti-ballistic missiles.

To round up this list, on July 4, 2000, the Foreign Ministers of these same five nations gathered in Dushanbe, Tajikistan's capital. To better coordinate regional and international issues, the leaders of the five nations decided to further improve and promote the institutionalization of cooperation within the framework of the Shanghai Five. They, therefore, agreed to meet annually in the five countries in the future to exchange views and consultations on pressing issues facing the regional and global community; There was unanimous support for the establishment of a Coordination Council within the framework of the Five and status as a working body of the Shanghai Five. Based on the consensus reached by the foreign ministers, the heads of state of the five countries reached a new consensus after their fifth meeting on May 5: further strengthen the institutionalization of the "Shanghai Five", gradually develop the summit mechanism of the five countries into a multi-level and multi-faceted cooperation mechanism, to more effectively jointly fight against the "three forces", deepen cooperation in various fields, and consolidate regional security and stability. The



five countries will strengthen coordination on various international issues bearing on our common future and firmly oppose hegemonism and "new interventionism" in any form. (Xing Wencheng, Sun Zhuangzhi, 2007) This collective intention reached by the heads of state of the five countries was finally embodied by the joint signing of the Dushanbe Statement, in which the parties expressed their belief that the Dushanbe meeting would be a good start for the cooperation of the five countries in the new century.

The Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) was founded on June 15, 2001, in Shanghai, China, due to these five nations' similar aspirations. Shanghai hosted. The countries convened in Shanghai to discuss the Shanghai Five Heads of State Conference's five-year successes and agreed to strengthen multilateral cooperation. The heads of state lauded the SCO's founding and reiterated its aims and ideals in their statements. They also underlined the beneficial role the SCO would play in fostering comprehensive collaboration among its member nations and advocated for collective efforts to defeat the "three forces" and develop multilateral economic and trade cooperation. They also signed the Declaration on the Establishment of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization and the Shanghai Convention on Combating Terrorism, Separatism and Extremism. They stressed that "elevating the 'Shanghai Five' mechanism to a higher level of cooperation will help all member states more effectively utilize opportunities and cope with new challenges and threats together."

Sixth, after the organization's initial growing period, all SCO members concluded: Pakistan, Iran, and India were granted observer status during the SCO Heads of State Council meeting in Astana on July 5, 2005, expanding the SCO's multilateral and mutually beneficial partnership potential. Astana hosted this gathering. Second, on June 11, 2010, passed the Tashkent summit "of the Shanghai cooperation organization regulation on accepting new members. (SCO website,2010) This form officially opened the door to expanding the staff. The regulation enabled Pakistan and India to become full members, while Iran's previous application was put on hold because it did not meet the criteria of "not under UN Security Council sanctions". The modified Procedure for Granting SCO Membership and the amended Model Memorandum on the Obligations of Applicant States to Join the SCO were approved at the Dushanbe Summit on September 12, 2014, solidifying the legal basis for SCO membership growth. The Model Memorandum on the Obligations of SCO Applicant States combines these two papers. Fourth, all member states agreed that adding new members and engaging with observer nations and dialogue partners might improve the SCO's growth potential. Hence, the SCO Member States began admitting India and Pakistan at the Ufa Summit on July 9, 2015, based on a multilateral agreement. India and Pakistan signed a memorandum of understanding on their obligations to join the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) during the 15th anniversary Tashkent Summit on June 24, 2016. India and Pakistan were invited to join the Shanghai Cooperation Organization during a June 9 session in Astana. The member states of the SCO agreed that "the membership of India and Pakistan will expand the potential of the Organisation and enhance its role on the international stage as a multilateral mechanism for addressing major current issues in the region, ensuring security, stability and sustainable development".(SCO website, 2016) Against the backdrop of dramatic changes in the global and



regional political and economic situation, the SCO's first expansion since its establishment 16 years ago marks a new stage of development for the organization on a trans-regional and trans-sectoral basis.

Conclusion: The practice of genuine multilateralism and the deep institutionalization of SCO

To sum up, the institutionalization and expansion of SCO membership are in line with the path assumed by this study, that is, after the Cold War, the original Sino-Soviet border issue was transformed into a "Bilateral" negotiation with China on one side and Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan on the other. The settlement of the border issue has fostered a consensus foundation for further cooperation among countries. With the turbulence of the new geopolitical situation and the major threat posed by the "three forces", the five countries, based on their common strategic energy interests, military and security interests and potential economic interests, have successively passed five "bilateral" meetings and five "multilateral" heads of state meetings, and finally expanded the areas of consensus based on the five countries' cooperation: It is necessary to further enrich and improve the "Shanghai Five" mechanism and gradually develop the "Shanghai Five" summit mechanism into a multi-tiered and multi-dimensional institutional cooperation platform of the five countries, to more effectively jointly combat the "three forces" and deepen cooperation in various fields to consolidate regional security and stability. Based on this consensus, the heads of state of the Shanghai Five and Uzbekistan met in Shanghai in June 2001 and issued the Declaration on the Establishment of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, declaring the establishment of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization based on the Shanghai Five. Since then, a new type of regional cooperation organization with a more institutionalized operation and more comprehensive areas and levels of cooperation has been formally declared. This institutionalized result conforms to the trend of The Times and ADAPTS to the urgent need for regional security and development.

Similarly, the expansion of SCO membership follows this path. For a long time, South Asia has been faced with complex traditional and non-traditional security situations, difficulties in economic development, energy shortage and other problems. These problems also mean that India, Pakistan and other SCO member states have more common interests in security, energy, economy and other fields. To achieve a better balance between their national interests and common interests, India and Pakistan have chosen an appropriate time to conduct bilateral or multilateral coordination with SCO member states, and have put forward their application to join the SCO at the SCO Heads of State summits. After many negotiations in Tashkent, Dushanbe and Ufa, In the end, the SCO member states agreed that "the membership of India and Pakistan will expand the potential of the Organisation and enhance its role on the international stage as a multilateral mechanism for addressing current major issues in the region and safeguarding security, stability and sustainable development". Therefore, the first expansion of the SCO membership is the final expression of the cooperation intention reached between India, Pakistan and the SCO member states on crisis management and common interests. It can also be said that the SCO enlargement itself is part of its



institutionalization process.

Both the establishment of the SCO and every expansion of its membership embody the concept of genuine multilateralism. It emphasizes the Shanghai Spirit of "mutual trust, mutual benefit, equality, consultation, respect for diversity of civilizations and pursuit of common development". It stands for the principles of "Non-interference in other countries' internal affairs", "consensus building", "extensive consultation, joint contribution and shared benefits", "openness and inclusiveness" and so on. Ultimately, we will build an SCO community of shared future.



References

- According to data released by India's Ministry of Oil and Gas in June 2015, India's oil imports accounted for 27.8% of India's total imports in the first half of 2014-2015. Oil import dependence rate is 78.4%, Snapshot of India's Petroleum&Gas Data, June 22, 2015,
- Ding, C.(2017). Analysis of the expansion of SCO Membership and the economic relations among its member states. *Eurasian Economics*, No.5.
- Editorial Department of the Yearbook of the People's Republic of China, Ed., (2001). *The Yearbook of the People's Republic of China*, Beijing: PLA Press, p. 628.
- Feng, Y. (1997). The Struggle of Great Powers and Regional Powers over Central Asia and the Caucasus and its Influence. *Eastern European and Central Asian Studies*, No.6.
<http://chn.sectscsco.org/documents>.
- Lu, Z. W. (2000). *International Strategic Situation at the Turn of the Century*. Beijing: Shishi Press, p. 7.
- Luo, Y.(2002). *Century Retrospect and Prospect: Strategic Assessment*, 2002 Edition, Beijing: Military Science Press,p. 43.
- On 14 June 2001, before the establishment of the SCO, Uzbekistan joined the "Shanghai Five" process and became a founding member of the new organization.
- On April 26, 1996, the five heads of state held their first summit at the Shanghai Exhibition Center and signed the "Agreement on Strengthening Confidence in the Military Field in the Border Areas". On 24 April 1997, the five heads of State held a second meeting in Moscow and signed the Agreement on Mutual Reduction of Military Forces in the Border Areas.
- Pakistan Energy Minister Khawaja Asif: Energy crisis more acute than terrorism,
<http://news.bjx.com.cn/html/20130814/452732.shtml>. August 20, 2015.
- Pan, G., Hu, J.(2006). *The First New Type of Regional Cooperation Organization in the 21st Century*, Beijing: CPC Central Party School Press, p. 42.
- People's Daily. (2000, July 5). Joint Communique of the results of the Foreign Ministers' Meeting between China, Tajikistan, Russia and Kyrgyzstan.
- Qiu, C. Q. (2019). The Process, Impetus and Impact of India's accession to the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, *South and Southeast Asia Study*, No.3, pp. 5-6.
- Shanghai Cooperation Organization's Website. (2010, June 11th). The Regulation on Accepting New Members of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization,
- Shanghai Cooperation Organization's Website. (2016, June 24th). Tashkent Declaration on the 15th Anniversary of the SCO,
- Shubhajit, R. (2010, June 12th). India is closer to SCO membership. The Indian Express,
- Sun Jing: Research on China-Russia Common Interests in Central Asia and their Realization Mechanism, Beijing: Guangming Daily Press, 2014, pp. 97-98.
- Sun, J.(2014). *Research on the Common Interests between China and Russia in Central Asia and Their Realization Mechanism*. Beijing: Guangming Daily Press, p. 107.
- Tovyeka, K.(2002). *The Diplomatic Strategy of the Eagle of Central Asia*. Beijing: Xinhua Publishing House, p. 221.
- Up to 1993, 229 oil and gas fields have been discovered in Central Asia, including 69 oil fields and 180 gas fields. See An, Z.X., Hu, Z. Q. (1993). Oil and Gas Regions in Central Asia, Petroleum Industry Press.
- Xing, W, Sun, Z. Z.(2007). *Research on Shanghai Cooperation Organization*. Changchun: Changchun Publishing House, p. 2.



- Xing, W, Sun, Z. Z.(2007). *Research on Shanghai Cooperation Organization*. Changchun: Changchun Publishing House, p. 8.
- XinhuaNet.(2015, July 7). Deepen the Enlargement, Assist in the Silk Road, Overseas Experts and Scholars Looking ufa Shanghai Cooperation Organization Summit. http://www.xinhuanet.com/world/2015-07/07/c_1115839679.htm.
- Xu, T.,& Ji, Z(2002). *Shanghai Cooperation Organization: New Security Concept and New Mechanism*. Beijing: Shishi Press, p.1.
- Xu, Y. Q. (2003). *A Study on the Transformation of the Five Central Asian States*, Beijing: Minzu Publishing House, p. 226.